



**Evaluation Committee Meeting Minutes**

Town of Lake Park, Florida

Request for Proposal No. 104-2016

Kelsey and Lake Shore Parks

Restroom Construction and Renovation

Wednesday, September 14, 2016 2:00 p.m.

Commission Chamber, Town Hall, 535 Park Avenue

The Evaluation Committee meeting was conducted on Wednesday, September 14, 2016 at 2:00 p.m. Present were Town Manager John D’Agostino, Finance Director Blake Rane, Public Works Director David Hunt, Project Manager Richard Pittman, Operations Manager Richard Scherle, and Town Clerk Vivian Mendez.

Finance Director Rane called the meeting to order at 2:00 p.m. and introduced himself and staff as members of the Evaluation Committee for Kelsey and Lake Shore Parks Restroom Construction and Renovation. Project Manager Pittman explained that bids were opened and read aloud on Tuesday, September 13, 2016 at 2:00 p.m. He explained that three bidders submitted for this project, and that Anatom Construction was lowest base bidder. Furthermore, Anatom Construction did not include signed acknowledgements of the addendums or a bid bond as part of their submittal. He suggested that the Committee determine whether the bid should be accepted prior to further discussion. Town Manager D’Agostino suggested that the absence of the required documents was inexcusable.

**Motion: Town Manager D’Agostino moved to reject the submittal of Anatom Construction for non-responsiveness; Project Manager Pittman seconded the motion.**

Project Manager Pittman stated, “Bids or proposals which are submitted without the required bid security shall be rejected” as governed by Ordinance 04-2016 (See Exhibit “A”).

Vote on Motion:

Committee Member	Aye	Nay	Other
Committee Member D’Agostino	X		
Committee Member Hunt	X		
Committee Member Pittman	X		
Committee Member Scherle	X		

Motion passed 4-0.

Project Manager Pittman explained that All-Site Construction submitted a bid that he believed to be responsive. He distributed copies of the submittal of All-Site Construction to the Committee and explained that the company had submitted all of the required documents. Project Manager Pittman explained the unit prices on the bid tabulation sheet (See Exhibit “B”). Finance Director Rane informed the Committee that All-Site Construction did not provide a quote for the removal and disposal of concrete slabs. (See Exhibit “B”). Project Manager Pittman explained that All-Site Construction failed to

provide a quote and suggested that moving forward the Town may request the removal fee to be \$0.00. Finance Director Rane asked if the omission was curable. Town Manager D’Agostino explained that he believed it was a curable omission. Project Manager Pittman suggested that the omission was curable by negotiation.

**Motion: Town Manager D’Agostino moved that item 12-B of the bid tabulation was a curable omission by All-Site Construction; Project Manager Pittman seconded the motion.**

Vote on Motion:

Committee Member	Aye	Nay	Other
Committee Member D’Agostino	X		
Committee Member Hunt	X		
Committee Member Pittman	X		
Committee Member Scherle	X		

Motion passed 4-0.

Project Manager Pittman continued to explain the submittal of All-Site Construction and directed the attention of the Committee to item 14-C of the bid tabulation. He informed the Committee that he had made several corrections due to miscalculations and explained that the revised base bid was \$561,040.60 after the reduction of about \$4,500.00 from the original submittal.

Town Manager D’Agostino directed the attention of the Committee to 12-B of the bid tabulation and asked for direction for purposes of negotiation. Project Manager Pittman informed the Committee that two representatives of All-Site Construction were present and asked that they address the Committee.

The representative of All-Site Construction explained that they did not have the correct unit price for items 12-B and 14-C of the bid tabulation to provide to the Committee. Public Works Director Hunt explained item 12-B as it requests the unit price for the removal, disposal and the creation of each concrete slab. The All-Site Construction representative asked the Committee “what is the procedure to submit the corrected document”? Town Manager D’Agostino would like the item negotiated however, it should not exceed the quoted average cost per unit provided by West Construction. Public Works Director Hunt explained that the contractor might have failed to provide a quote for 12-B due to the inclusion of associated costs in 12-A. Finance Director Rane asked the Committee “how would you like the contractor to communicate and by what time?” Town Manager D’Agostino suggested that the contractor submit the corrected quote in writing no later than 4:00 p.m. on Thursday, September 15, 2016 to the Town Clerk’s Office. Project Manager Pittman asked that All-Site Construction also acknowledge the correction of item 14-C. The representative agreed to make the suggested corrections and to submit to the Office of the Town Clerk.

Finance Director Rane asked the Committee for further comments. Town Manager D’Agostino suggested that the bid process should move forward in efforts to provide a recommendation to the Town Commission because the base bids exceed the amount budgeted for the project. Finance Director Rane asked the Committee for further

comments. Town Manager D’Agostino asked if it was correct to assume that blank unit costs for item 13 of the bid tabulation were services provided by the Town. Project Manager Pittman answered “no” and informed the Committee that All-Site Construction did include unit prices for items 12-A & 13 of the bid tabulation and that he had failed to include them in as part of the document. He stated, “the unit price for item 12-A was \$2,168.00 and the unit price of item 13 was \$1,816”. Finance Director Rane asked the about item 8-D on page one of the bid tabulation, where a quote of \$32.81 was provided but the Town did not specify a unit quantity for “reduced trenching & conduit”. Project Manager Pittman explained that in the event that the Town could salvage conduit, it could be used as part of the distance of item 8-D. Finance Director Rane explained that in the event of the use of salvaged conduit the number of feet and unit prices would be reduced. Operations Manager Scherle suggested that the reuse of conduit would be more expensive. Project Manager Pittman agreed with Finance Director Rane and Operations Manager Scherle and suggested that All-Site Construction review the quote provided for item 8-D. The representative of All-Site Construction agreed. Project Manager Pittman explained that the reduced price would be included as part of the change order to be determined upon the assessment of the electrician.

Project Manager Pittman explained that the submitted agenda request form would disclose that items 14 C, D & E were to be determined after removal of the roof. He explained that the Committee would ask the Commission to include a contingency based on the unknowns for the project. Town Manager D’Agostino asked if there was a percentage included in the Towns Procurement Ordinance. Finance Director Rane answered “no, it is not specified in the Ordinance”. Town Manager D’Agostino asked if there would be five portable toilets provided for one month or five months. Finance Director Rane explained that they would be provided for a total of five months and rotated each month.

Town Manager D’Agostino asked if there should be discussion about the alternates. Project Manager Pittman explained that alternates should be discussed and referenced to the Town Commission in the event of increases and decreases.

**Motion: Town Manager D’Agostino moved to evaluate the total base bid of All-Site Construction prior to making a recommendation to the Town Commission; The motion failed for lack of a second.**

This motion was withdrawn by Town Manager D’Agostino.

**Motion: Public Works Director Hunt moved to accept the submittal of All-Site Construction as the lowest, responsive, responsible bidder based on further clarification of items; Project Manager Pittman seconded the motion.**

Vote on Motion:

Committee Member	Aye	Nay	Other
Committee Member D’Agostino	X		
Committee Member Hunt	X		
Committee Member Pittman	X		
Committee Member Scherle	X		

Motion passed 4-0.

Public Works Director Hunt explained that he purposely omitted the amount of the base bid in his previous motion due to the anticipated submittal of All-Site Construction on Thursday, September 15, 2016 at 4:00 p.m.

**Motion: Town Manager D’Agostino moved to continue upon completion of the base bid amount and clarifications by All-Site Construction to the Commission for consideration; Public Works Director Hunt seconded the motion.**

Vote on Motion:

Committee Member	Aye	Nay	Other
Committee Member D’Agostino	X		
Committee Member Hunt	X		
Committee Member Pittman	X		
Committee Member Scherle	X		

Motion passed 4-0.

Project Manager Pittman asked if the representative of All-Site Construction would like to inform the Committee of the services provided by their company. Project Coordinator Angel Fashaw has worked for All-Site Construction Company for two years. She explained that the company was established in 2001 and that the owner has since then completed for various projects for clients including municipalities. Project Manager Pittman asked “what type of trade employees are within your company?”. Project Coordinator Fashaw explained that various trade specialists were employed with All-Site Construction and that their expertise supports their credentials to oversee and complete projects. Project Manager Pittman asked Project Coordinator Fashaw if her company was aware of the minimal amount of work to be provided by them in compliance with Palm Beach County and the Davis-Bacon Act. Project Coordinator Fashaw acknowledged that All-Site Construction was aware of the minimal requires work; she added that they had previously worked with Palm Beach County and were familiar with the Davis-Bacon Act.

Public Works Director Hunt asked if the Committee would continue the discussion about the alternates. Finance Director Rane suggested that the alternates for the project are highly unlikely. Project Manager Pittman asked if the deduction for shingle roofing should be included in the agenda request form. Town Manager D’Agostino explained that the difference in price was \$9,400.00 and stated, “I don’t believe that is a significant amount of savings”. Finance Director Rane asked Project Manager Pittman to include subtotals for the alternates. Project Manager Pittman agreed to include the subtotals as part of final bid tabulation sheet. Town Manager D’Agostino suggested that the alternates not be reviewed in lump sum amounts without consideration to future projects. He explained that some items within the project i.e. Tennis Court Lighting and Trash Receptacles may have to be budgeted as future projects. Project Manager Pittman asked the representative of All-Site Construction to submit the unit price for alternate five. Town Manager D’Agostino suggested to that the bid tabulation sheet should be corrected upon the submittal of All-Site Construction. He explained that a recommendation should be provided to the Town Commission as a result of the final base bid and alternates. Project Manager Pittman explained the specifications within the bid for a particular

manufacturers lighting and suggested that it could become competitive in the future. Public Works Director Hunt explained that the Town had a design that may correlate with alternate vendors. Town Manager D’Agostino asked if the light pole locations were specified. Public Works Director Hunt answered “yes” and explained that they were very specific and that the Town could demand that future vendors comply with the established design and light pole locations. Town Manager D’Agostino suggested providing all alternates and a corrected bid tabulation to the Commission for further discussion. Finance Director Rane agreed to corrections of the bid tabulation and suggested highlighting the prices of the “S” tile within alternates two and three. Finance Director Rane asked Project Manager Pittman to explain alternates six and seven. Project Manager Pittman explained that alternates six and seven were the results of preparation for demolition per the advisement of lateral pipe sizes by Seacoast Utilities. He explained that alternates six and seven may not be necessary, and that connection to the sewer was included as part of the base bid. Project Manager Pittman suggested that alternate seven was an item that needed to be discussed with the Town Commission. He explained that alternate seven would include the installation of new water service pipes from the new restroom building to the potential location of a water meter.

**Motion: Town Manager D’Agostino moved to accept the alternates per discussed modifications; Public Works Director Hunt seconded the motion.**

Vote on Motion:

Committee Member	Aye	Nay	Other
Committee Member D’Agostino	X		
Committee Member Hunt	X		
Committee Member Pittman	X		
Committee Member Scherle	X		

Motion passed 4-0.

**ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business to come before the Evaluation Committee and after a motion to adjourn by Town Manager D’Agostino and seconded by Public Works Director Hunt, and by unanimous vote, the meeting adjourned at 3:15 p.m.

  
 Administrative Assistant, Shaquita Edwards

~~contract with the federal, state, or municipal governments or any other governmental agency or political subdivision providing the vendor extends the same terms and conditions of the contract to the Town.~~ Cooperative purchasing or piggybacking is only allowed for the purchase of the same product or service and limited only to variances in the quantity and or minor features of a product or service. The town may cooperatively purchase or piggyback from vendors or contractors who have been selected after a competitive process and selected by other governmental entities who are subject to competitive solicitations by Florida law. The vendor or contractor shall confirm in writing that it will provide the goods or services to the Town based upon the terms of the contract which is the subject of the cooperative purchasing . The Town and vendor or contractor shall enter into a contract which incorporates the terms of the cooperative purchasing contract. Cooperative purchases shall be subject to the approval levels specified in § 2-247.

(f) *Field purchase orders.* Field purchase orders may be utilized for purchases of less than \$1,500.00. Field purchase orders do not require the preparation of a purchase requisition by the ~~procuring~~originating department or the approval of the finance director prior to the procurement of a commodity and/or service. The ~~procuring~~originating department is responsible for ensuring that a competitive price is received for the commodity and/or service ordered, and that the budgetary appropriation for the commodity and/or service purchased is not over ~~expanded~~expended. The town manager or the finance department shall determine the integrity of such purchases.

(g) *Construction services.* The procurement of construction services by the town shall be acquired in accordance with the competitive sealed bid process outlined in § 2-248.

(1) Bid security shall be required for all competitive sealed bidding for construction contracts when the total cost of construction is estimated by the town manager or the finance director to exceed \$200,000.00. Bid security shall be an original bid bond executed by a surety company admitted and authorized to do business in the State of Florida. Cash, a certificate of deposit, treasurer's check, or a certified cashier's check satisfactory to the town may be tendered in lieu of the bid bond. Nothing contained herein shall prevent the town from requiring bid security on construction contracts ~~under of less than~~ \$200,000.00 as determined in the discretion of the town manager to be in the best interest of the town. Bid security shall be in an amount deemed sufficient by the town manager to ~~insure~~ ensure bid compliance but in no event shall the bid security be less than five percent of the bid amount.

(2) Bids or proposals which are submitted without the required bid security shall be rejected.

(3) Any person, firm or entity ~~whothat~~ enters into a written construction contract with the town which is for \$200,000.00 or more shall, before commencing the work, execute and deliver to the town within the time specified by the contract or procurement documents, a payment and performance bond, each in the amount equal to or greater than 100 percent of the total contract price, unless the amount of the bonds is reduced to a lesser amount as determined by the town commission, but in no event shall the amount of each bond be less than 100 percent of the total contract price. The bonds shall be issued by a surety insurer authorized to do business in the State of Florida as a surety. The required bonds shall also be recorded in the public records of Palm Beach County. At the

Exhibit "B"

**BID TABULATION**  
**KELSEY AND LAKE SHORE PARKS RESTROOM CONSTRUCTION & RENOVATION**  
**TOWN OF LAKE PARK BID NO. 104-2016**

ITEM NO.	ITEM DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	ALL-SITE CONSTRUCTION		WEST CONSTRUCTION INC.		ANATOM CONSTRUCTION CO.	
				UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	INDEMNIFICATION	Job	1		\$ 1,000.00		\$ 10.00		\$ 25,000.00
2	GENERAL CONDITIONS				\$ 7,500.00				
2A	Mobilization	Job	1		\$ 10,000.00		\$ 63,304.00		\$ 60,200.00
2B	Registration with the Town, No-Fee Town Permit, Renovation Permit	Job	1		\$ 50.00		\$ 500.00		\$ 2,000.00
2C	Payment Bond & a Performance Bond	Job	1		\$ 10,000.00		\$ 6,000.00		\$ 9,660.00
2D	Shop Drawing Processing	Job	1		\$ 500.00		\$ 600.00		\$ 10,000.00
2E	Project Close-Out incl. Record Drawings, Manuals, & Warranties	Job	1		\$ 500.00		\$ 5,068.00		\$ 2,000.00
3	Temporary Silt Fencing Around Kelsey Site	Job	1		\$ 750.00		\$ 10,864.00		\$ 3,500.00
4	Temporary access corridor, cap sprinkler heads & restore grass & concrete	Job	1		\$ 1,000.00		\$ 4,570.00		\$ 3,500.00
5	Select soil import for building pad, walkways, and transition fill incl. grading, compaction, soil testing & report	C.Y.	260	\$ 9.61	\$ 2,498.60	\$ 62.00	\$ 16,120.00		\$ 15,600.00
6	Remove encountered abandoned utility pipe	L.F.	100	\$ 10.00	\$ 1,000.00	\$ 8.50	\$ 850.00		\$ 1,500.00
7	Cap abandoned utility pipes	EA.	8	\$ 3.00	\$ 24.00	\$ 80.00	\$ 640.00		\$ 800.00
8A	New restroom/storage building in Kelsey Park	L.S.	1		\$ 256,939.00		\$ 230,494.00		\$ 199,420.00
8B	Water service line & connection to existing for new restroom building	L.F.	50	\$ 50.00	\$ 2,500.00	\$ 14.00	\$ 700.00		\$ 5,000.00
8C	Backflow prevention device	L.S.	1		\$ 1,100.00		\$ 850.00		\$ 2,000.00
8D	Electrical service	L.F.	250	\$ 30.00	\$ 7,500.00	\$ 34.00	\$ 8,500.00		\$ 6,440.00
	Reduced trenching & conduit \$ /l.f.			\$ 32.81		\$ 10.00		no quote	
8E	Sanitary sewer connection per Seacoast Utility Authority requirements	L.F.	20	\$ 700.00	\$ 14,000.00	\$ 37.00	\$ 740.00		\$ 4,000.00
8F	Construct concrete walkways and ramped walkways	S.Y.	219	\$ 40.00	\$ 8,760.00	\$ 70.00	\$ 15,330.00	78	\$ 17,082.00
8G	Construct reinforced concrete steps	L.S.	1		\$ 7,000.00		\$ 8,000.00		\$ 2,000.00
8H	Hand rail at ramped walkway and steps	L.F.	170	\$ 81.00	\$ 13,770.00	\$ 70.00	\$ 11,900.00		\$ 13,812.50
9	Site drainage (basin, swale, sod)	L.S.	1		\$ 50.00		\$ 4,400.00		\$ 6,000.00
10	Build irrigation system in areas receiving fill dirt and in dry detention area.								
10A	Sch. 40 pipe, fittings, flex pipe 1" or less	L.F.	250	\$ 15.00	\$ 3,750.00	\$ 12.00	\$ 3,000.00		\$ 3,750.00
10B	Sch. 40 pipe, fittings, flex pipe 1-1/4" through 2"	L.F.	150	\$ 18.00	\$ 2,700.00	\$ 13.00	\$ 1,950.00		\$ 2,700.00

**BID TABULATION (CONTINUED)**  
**KELSEY AND LAKE SHORE PARKS RESTROOM CONSTRUCTION & RENOVATION**  
**TOWN OF LAKE PARK BID NO. 104-2016**

				ALL-SITE CONSTRUCTION		WEST CONSTRUCTION INC.		ANATOM CONSTRUCTION CO.	
ITEM NO.	ITEM DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
11	Sod (Floritam)	L.S.	1		\$ 3,500.00		\$ 9,250.00		\$ 5,000.00
12A	Park Benches, 6' (remove & dispose of existing, provide & install new)	EA.	15		\$ 32,520.00		\$ 40,500.00		\$ 20,025.00
12B	Remove & dispose of concrete slabs for benches, construct new slabs	EA.	3	??????	no quote	\$ 630.00	\$ 1,890.00		\$ 3,000.00
13	Trash receptacles	EA.	6		\$ 10,896.00		\$ 12,720.00		\$ 6,000.00
14A	Renovations to Lake Shore Park Restroom	L.S.	1		\$ 153,028.00		\$ 118,151.00		\$ 79,325.00
14B	Reroof Lake Shore Park Restroom ("S" tile) incl. dormer removal, reframe &	L.S.	1		\$ 6,300.00		\$ 11,500.00		\$ 7,000.00
14C	Replace rotted roof sheathing	S.F.	96	\$ 5.00	\$ 480.00	\$ 3.50	\$ 336.00		\$ 960.00
14D	Replace damaged fascia	L.F.	20	\$ 5.00	\$ 100.00	\$ 6.70	\$ 134.00		\$ 1,000.00
14E	Replace damaged soffit incl. vents	L.F.	20	\$ 35.00	\$ 700.00	\$ 11.00	\$ 220.00		\$ 2,000.00
15	(5) Portable toilets for public use	Month	5	\$ 125.00	\$ 625.00	\$ 340.00	\$ 1,700.00		\$ 3,000.00
<b>BASE BID: TOTAL ITEMS 1 THROUGH 15</b>					<b>\$561,040.60</b>		<b>\$ 590,791.00</b>		<b>\$ 523,274.50</b>

CORRECTED AMOUNT



**BID SUBMITTAL DID  
NOT INCLUDE SIGNED  
ADDENDUM AND  
BID BOND**

**BID TABULATION (CONTINUED)**  
**KELSEY AND LAKE SHORE PARKS RESTROOM CONSTRUCTION & RENOVATION**  
**TOWN OF LAKE PARK BID NO. 104-2016**

ITEM DESCRIPTION	ALL-SITE CONSTRUCTION	WEST CONSTRUCTION INC.	ANATOM CONSTRUCTION CO.
ALTERNATE I: Install Dimensional Asphalt Shingle Roof in lieu of "S" tile roof			
a. Kelsey Park ..... Deduct	\$ 5,900.00	\$ 2,400.00	\$ 5,900.00
b. Lake Shore Park Restroom ..... Deduct	\$ 3,500.00	\$ 1,500.00	\$ 5,100.00
ALTERNATE II: Re-roof of Community Meeting Building			
a. With "S" tile as specified for restroom building ..... Add	\$ 17,900.00	\$ 20,048.00	\$ 17,900.00
b. With Dimensional Asphalt shingle as specified ..... Add	\$ 13,350.00	\$ 15,000.00	\$ 13,350.00
c. Remove dormers, reframe and sheath ..... Add	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 3,400.00	\$ 960.00
d. *Total bid items 14C, 14D, 14E ..... Add	\$ 5,780.00	\$ 690.00	\$ 3,960.00
ALTERNATE III: Re-roof of Tennis Center Office Building			
a. With "S" tile as specified ..... Add	\$ 7,900.00	\$ 9,620.00	\$ 7,900.00
b. With Dimensional Asphalt Shingle as specified ..... Add	\$ 4,100.00	\$ 5,800.00	\$ 5,100.00
c. Remove dormers, reframe and sheath ..... Add	\$ 2,000.00	\$ 3,400.00	\$ 960.00
d. *Total bid items 14C, 14D, 14E ..... Add	\$ 5,780.00	\$ 690.00	\$ 3,960.00
ALTERNATE IV: Tennis Court Lighting			
a. Install all (empty) conduits from panel location to future pole locations ..... Add	\$ 10,560.00	\$ 15,680.00	\$ 9,600.00
b. Demolish existing lighting system and install the new poles, lighting, controls, conduits, and wiring for a complete system ..... Add	\$ 202,950.00	\$ 155,680.00	\$ 194,500.00
ALTERNATE V: Benches and Trash Receptacles for Lake Shore Park			
a. Park Benches same as bid item 12A... 11 @ \$ ___ /ea. .... Add	\$ 2,168.00	\$ 29,700.00	\$ 14,685.00
b. Trash Receptacles same as bid item 13... 9 @ \$ ___ /ea. .... Add	\$ 1,816.00	\$ 19,080.00	\$ 9,000.00
ALTERNATE VI: Deduct line item 8E, Add 40 l.f. 6" PVC sanitary sewer. Add 40 l.f. @\$ ___ /l.f. Add	15 \$ 600.00	\$ 1,800.00	\$ 4,000.00
ALTERNATE VII: Additional potable water line installed 24' deep within drainage corridor 210 l.f. @ Add	50 \$ 10,500.00	\$ 6,300.00	\$ 5,322.00